## AN IMAGINARY DIA-LOGUE: A COMPARA-TIVE LOOK AT CON-TEMPORARY THAI AND WESTERN POETRY<sup>1</sup>

## Chetana Nagavajara<sup>2</sup>

I do not wish to sound pessimistic, but it is time that the image of Thailand as a land of smiles should be questioned. In this respect, contemporary Thai poetry can substantiate my point that contemporary Thai society is extremely complex and defies any simplification. As we are meeting at Sanam Chandra Palace in Nakorn Pathom, it is only appropriate that I begin with a poem by Saksiri Meesomsueb (born 1956) "Retracing Footprints on the Path", which was the very first poem read at a poetry reading session on 14 March 1997, at Tabkhwan House, only a few steps away from our meeting place today. The poem is quoted here in full in a translation by Chamnongsri Hanchanelak.

"Paper birds panicked into flight
Reeling in vast tear-filled skies
Boom, Boom....scattered in
fright
Bang Bang...ee-poh guns
broke the air
Shot out chamaliang bullets
Bright-eyed ones dropped
drooped
Eye-balls burst - broke and bled

Blood dripped dropped like prized gems Smooth flesh breached By powered thrust of iron blades Screams reverberated through the land but valued no more than fruitflies' buzz. Back and forth, back and forth Tears flooded the clouds Little rabbit's up to its neck in despair Grabbed heaven-spire, pulled hope crashing down Rainbow ghost lunged his lightening rod Ripping through the startled chest Rainbow ghost sucked dry the blood The sky moans mixed with fierce gun-fires Was it this tamarind tree or some other? Sobbing Pigtail, Topknot and Glae queried Was it on this branch or another, pretty tree, That they hung the beloved maid? Breezes blew, branch bent, body swung Beaten, battered, kicked as it hung No words, no cries, no recrimination Was the rope so tight that vou're silent? Your eyes bulged, tongue hung Is it rage that clenched your fist Let anger dissolve with the

dissolving breath

For your corpse they've

cremated with burning tires

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Paper presented at the 17<sup>th</sup> World Congress of Poets, Nakorn Pathom, Thailand, 24-28 July 2002.

<sup>2</sup> Emeritus Professor of German, Silapakorn University, Nakorn Pathom, Thailand.

They cupped hands to make megaphones

For trumpeting news they'd concocted

That we were a fungal and leprous lot

With spotted hinds and scarlet heads

Then they threw olive grenades
Ten thousand *ee-poh* guns
responded

Spattering *Chamaliang* bullets Smashing lives, scattering bodies

None died but revived by magic wah

The dead were quickened with life

Not killed, not dead, we're alive the wounded cured, the dead revived

Not killed, we're still here to stand fast

Hope and dreams are beaconbright

We select, analyze and put away

Keep this, discard that to find the win-way

You on your side, we on ours Differing yet steadfast...with Truth

Lets' cross the peaks of ignorance

To reach victory through
wisdom of mankind
Like fire is the vengeful heart
Let die the hatred of days past
"Foes to be fought is the abasing
Delusion

That inhabits the human mind" Come...keep banana guns against the wall

And hone our wits for the vital war

Make it sharp of edge and great

of depth

Set tactics for strategic of peace Sixth October 2519

Retracing footprints on the path Subtracting a finger or a toe for each year

None's left on my hands and feet, dear friends

Counting fingers and toes that day to this

It's been twenty years, dear friends

Counting fingers and toes that day to this

It's been twenty years, dear friends"<sup>3</sup>

As you may have experienced from the video presentation, the response to the reading by the poet was overwhelming. Saksiri Meesomsueb and 15 other poets responded to an invitation by a research group engaged in a comparative research project entitled "Poetry as an Intellectual and Spiritual Force in Contemporary Society: Experiences from Thai, British-Irish, American, French and German Literatures". The poets interacted with the researchers on a number of issues related to the cultural environment that had induced them to become poets. After the morning and afternoon seminar sessions, the poets gathered again at Tabkhwan House for a reading session, each presenting one poem of his or her own which was expected to lend strength to the researchers' idealistic proposition that poetry is an intellectual and spiritual force in contemporary Thai society. It was no coincidence that "Retracing Footprints on the Path" should have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> A video recording of the reading session is available from the German Department, Faculty of Arts, Silpakorn University, Nakorn Pathom.

served as an overture to an altogether spiritually and intellectually enriching evening.

The poem might appear to be a departure from the traditional notion of Thailand as a pleasure-loving country. The old myth about its pristine innocence can no longer be sustained. The political events of 1973, 1976 and 1992 more than demonstrated that a brotherly conflict in this Far Eastern land could at any time degenerate into a fratricide. If the Establishment, including our own educational authorities, continues to endorse the traditional image of the land of smiles (our history textbooks deliberately turning a blind eye to the atrocious events), our literature, and especially our contemporary poetry, refuses to enter into a complicity against the Thai people and valiantly accepts the responsibility of being the guiding light in search of truth. (The Ministry of Education recently, under pressure, decided to take up accounts of the bloody events into the new official history book, soon to be published. One of the chief authors is none other than our poet Naowarat Phongphaiboon, who has written heart-rending poems on the events, but invited for the [wrong] reason that he was there on the scene!)

It goes without saying that the poem by Saksiri Meesomsueb should be able to touch a responsive chord in the Thai public, but could it be expected that our

friends from other countries would be in a position to react likewise? I have had experience of presenting Saksiri's poem to foreign audiences, and the responses were to be encouraging.4 It seems the poem contains a message which is supranational and in keeping with the times. In other words, it can enter into a dialogue with foreign counterparts. In order to establish a basis for such an exchange, it might be a good idea to explore contemporary Western aesthetic thinking which might help to show certain affinities with contemporary Thai poetry. I shall quote a few lines from "Discourse on the Poem" by the German poet, Christoph Meckel:

The poem is not the place,
where beauty is nurtured...
The poem is not the place,
where truth is adorned...
The poem is not the place,
where pain is healed...
The poem is not the place,
where dying is appeased,
where hunger is satisfied,
where hope is exalted.
The poem is the place for
mortally wounded truth.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> I wish to refer to lectures given at the following institutions: 13 August 1998 at the Siam Society, Bangkok (in English), 17 May 1999 at Leeds University (in English), 18 May 1999 at Manchester University (in English), 7 June 1999 at the Zentrum für Literaturforschoung, Berlin (in German) and 17 December 2001 at Hongkong Baptist University.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Das Gedicht ist nicht der Ort, wo die Schönheit gepflegt wird. [...]

Das Gedicht ist nicht der Ort, wo die Wahrheit verziert wird. [...]

Das Gedicht ist nicht der Ort, wo der Schmerz verheilt wird. [...]

Das Gedicht ist nicht der Ort, wo das Sterben begütigt, wo der Hunger gestillt, wo die Hoffnung verklärt wird.

Das Gedicht ist der Ort der zu Tode verwundeten Wahrheit.

Christoph Meckel: *Hundert Gedichte*. Ausgewählt von Harald Weinrich, München: Hanser 1988, S.67, V.1,5,9,14-16. (My translation)

We could almost reach the conclusion that Saksiri's "Retracing Footprints on the Path" has been written with Meckel's poetological programme in mind! The crux of the matter is what Meckel calls that "mortally wounded truth" which the poet does not hesitate to hurl into the face of his compatriots. The description of the event in stark naturalistic details probably goes beyond Meckel's poetological demand, but somehow does not lapse into an emotional paroxysm, for the poet knows how to steer the middle course and to contain the physical cruelty with an interplay between the real bloodbath and children's war games. The physical cruelty in the end is transformed into a philosophical cruelty6 which also can be explained in terms of Buddhism. The poet does not plead for forgetting but for forgiving, not in the legal sense of an amnesty which every military junta in Thailand declared after a coup d'état in order to exculpate the murderers as well as the murdered, but in a Buddhist sense. (In Thai we distinguish between "Aphaiyathan" [forgiving] from "Aphaiyathot" [amnesty])

What Saksiri is trying to present in his poem is a process of internalization of the historical event through *dharma*. This reminds me of a remark by Seamus Heaney on his departed friend, Ted Hughes: "...he [Ted Hughes] internalized the historical crises of the British nation [...] and transformed [them] into a healer's vision." It seems as though Saksiri's poem was written in

the spirit of Heaney's characterization of his friend. An *imaginary dialogue* has thus taken place between a Thai poet and his British colleague. We Thai should consider ourselves fortunate in that our contemporary poetry has attained what Thai society at large has not achieved, or rather lacked the will to achieve, namely, to come up with a "healer's vision' and thereby forge a new beginning (as embodied in the *finale* of the poem) or a regeneration.

On the concept of "regeneration" in contemporary literature, literary scholars cannot but admire the moral courage and the spiritual force shown by contemporary literature, however dark or dismal the image presented may be. The British germanist Ronald Peacock has very well characterized this trend.

For the moderns [...] the aesthetic acceptance of the terrifying but honest image of the dark aspects of life and humanity. presented suffering and helplessness compensating consolations, rests on the prior belief that one should in conscience pursue the truth, whatever it is, and whatever it shows. This gives back to literature [...] a functional role and importance, because there is implied in the whole situation the idea of regeneration; both individual and society are to be redeemed by the instrument of truth.8

Although we Thai did not experience the last world war in the same measure

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The term "philosophical cruelty" is borrowed from Jan Kott's book: Shakespeare notre contemporian, Paris 1962, p. 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> *The Observer*, 16 May 1999 (The Week, p. 4)

<sup>8 1972.</sup> p. 34.

as our European counterparts, yet it is still possible for us to enter into a dialogue with them, as our own tendency towards immolating our own brethren has some common elements with the European carnage. We should be grateful to our contemporary poets that they have the courage to confront all kinds of "historical crises", try to internalize and at the same time to surmount them. In this sense the French poet Daniel Biga never hesitates to give a clear answer: self-knowledge and knowledge of the world are prime conditions that must go hand in hand. The poem "Look" (Regarde) is a plaidoyer for an open worldview (in a literal sense).

## Look

Look at love clouds
Look at the daily sun
Look into yourself
Look feel listen taste touch
Breathe laugh cry sing dance
run love
I have made my most beautiful
journeys in your arms
You are free
You are alive
With your suffering and
your joy
Your are an immense look9

The penultimate line quoted sounds like an echo from the well-known poem "Prometheus" by Goethe in which the prime conditions of man are described ("Here I sit, shape man/ in my own image,/ A race, that like me shall/ Suffer, weep,/ Be happy and rejoice...")10 Furthermore, the inner and the outer worlds constitute here a unity, under the condition that one is open to all facets of human experience. Joy and suffering lie at the root of human existence which one must accept. From Goethe to Biga a transformation may have taken place. Whereas Goethe's protagonist has to fight for this prime condition, it has already become a normality in Biga's poem. Such an acceptance of the world and of the human condition as they really are represents a philosophical position common in contemporary poetry. The dean of contemporary Thai poets, Angkarn Kalayanaphong, elevates this worldview to a metaphysical height. He makes his point very clear in the poem "World"

The world is not dependent solely on valuable gems.

Sand and other things have partaken of its creation.

All lowly elements have done well in providing equilibrium

So that the universe will not be devoid of any constituent part.

This earth is not an abode reserved for golden swans. Crows have also their rightful place.

(j'ai fait mes plus beaux voyages entre tes bras)

Tu es libre
Tu es vivant
Avec ta souffrance et ta joie
Tu es un immense regard

Daniel Biga: Né nu, suivi de Oiseaux Monican et de Kilroy was here, Paris: Le Chereche Midi: 1984 (Coll. Points Fixes), p.69. (My translation)

Regarde l'amour les nuages regarde le soleil quotidien regarde à l'intérieur de toi regarde sens écoute goûte touche respire ris pleure chante danse cours aime

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> My translation. The original German is as follows:

<sup>&</sup>quot;Hier sitz' ich, forme Menschen Nach meinem Bilde, Ein Geschlecht, das mir gleich, sei, Zu leiden, zu weinen,

Those revelling in their own exclusiveness are mere idiots.

If there is no friendship, the world will be robbed of all happiness.<sup>11</sup>

How can we maintain such a precarious equilibrium in the face of the multifarious crises that beset our contemporary world? Another French poet has an answer to offer, namely, to lodge man in nature. In the poem entitled "On the Great Apposition of the World" (O la grande apposition du monde), Michel Deguy demonstrates how the natural sphere and the human sphere can merge harmoniously.

A field of roses near a field of corn and two red children in the field near the field of roses and a field of maize near the field of corn and two old willows at the point of convergence; the singing of two rose-coloured children in the field of corn near the field of roses and two old willows that watch over the roses the corn the red children and the maize...12

That two *red* children have transformed themselves into two *rose-coloured* children speaks for the power of nature. Another leading Thai poet Chang Sae Tang looks at this relationship between man and nature from another perspective. His approach to nature might qualify as anthropocentric.

When mother feeds her child with sweets
The fruits on the tree become sweet.
The sun shines on the tree
The branches sway in the wind.
Mother and child in mother's

While away their time under the tree. 13

Where will this East-West dialogue lead to? Have the Orientals led their Occidental colleagues so far from Christop Meckel's position that the latter are now ready to assume the role of healers and no longer take the poem as the place for "mortally wounded truth". There is no doubt that our poets are well aware that the twentieth-century man finds himself at the edge of the abyss which could devour him at any time. That they are ready and willing to counter such tragic possibility with their professed faith in life is a testimony to their creative force. The "historical crises" which Seamus Heaney mentioned offer our contemporary poets

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Angkarn Kalayanaphong: *Poems*, Bangkok: Siam Press 1999 (6. Aufl.) (Original: Thai; my translation)

un champ

de roses près d'un champ de blé et deux enfants

rouges dans le champ voisin du champ de roses

et un champ du maïs près du champ de blé et deux

saules vieux à la jointure; le chant de deux enfants

roses dans le champ de blé près du champ de roses

et deux vieux saules qui veillent les roses le blé les

enfants rouges et le maïs...

Miche Deguy: *Poèmes 1960-1970*, Paris: Gallimard 1973, pp. 17-18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Chang Sae Tang: "Mother and Child", in: *Analysis and Anthology of Thai Poetry*, p. 130. (My translation)

a unique opportunity to transform their "years abroad" into spiritual experiences. In this respect the American poet Denise Levertov has shown in her poem "In Thai Binh [Peace] Province" that poetry as an internalization of experience can franscend all painful memories.

[...] I've used up all my film on bombed hospitals, [...] and for the moments all my tears too are used up [...] So I'll use my burning eyes to photograph within me [...] [...] Peace within the long war. It is that life, unhurried, sure, persistent, I must bring home when I try to bring the war home. 14

The time when Westerners indulged in superficial flirtations with the Orient is now over. Contemporary poetry has endowed the process of globalization with a new meaning because it sets knowledge of the world as a precondition for knowledge of the self. The time-consecrated academic "Orientalism" no longer suffices, for a poetic dialogue requires more than just rational and intellectual activity. The English poet Grevel Lindop had spent years studying Buddhism with Thai and Cambodian monks (residing in England) and developed himself into a practising Buddhist before he decided to embark on a life's work, namely, an epic poem entitled "Touching the Earth: A Poem on the life of the Buddha"

[...] We'll use what we can find Golddust among the gravel: transmute the mind As best we can, offer it to the Lord. The lightbringer, the teacher who restored The lost path for our age. Give me your breath To praise once more that way past birth and death. Outside the worlds but starting from this ground. A prince's life, a Buddha's, one who found Safety, coolness, a lamp, a jewelled gate, A garden where the unspoiled virtues wait. All is impermanent: that teaching must Itself at last lie hidden in the dust Waiting another who will understand Its cryptic patterns, drifted with the sand Of beings' folly, and clear it once again

The reading which the poet gave on 18 January 1997 at the International Temple in Ubon Ratchathani Province was so convincing in its sincerity and commitment that one was tempted to call the work "confessions of a beautiful soul" (to borrow Goethe's concept from his novel Wilhelm Meister). In this way the East-West dialogue paves the way for a quest for "Nirvana".

To offer the world a path out of

its pain.15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Denise Levertov: In Thai Binh (Peace) Province, in: Carolyne Forsche (Edit.): *Against Forgetting*, New York: Norton 1993, p. 331.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Grevel Lindop: Touching the Earth: A Poem on the Life of the Buddha. Introduction, pp. 45-60. (Quoted from the unpublished manuscript with the kind permission of the author.)

Nevertheless, it should not be forgotten that we are dealing here with an imaginary dialogue. Most of our Thai poets have not mastered foreign languages well enough to be able to appreciate foreign poetry in the original form. Even their English, which they have learnt at school, remains defective. Translations from Western languages are few and far between. Conversely, Thai poetry is unknown in the West as a result of lack of translations. The anthologies that are available are not sufficiently publicized.16 With regard to the educational background of these Thai poets, the aforementioned meeting between poets and scholars on 13-14 March 1997 turned out to be most revelatory. Most Thai poets come from the provinces and draw from the riches of local culture. Their works derive from oral traditions, quite close to folk songs, and they learn their poetic art from a familial and communal environment. One poetess confessed that she was often scolded by her disciplinarian father. but always in verse, whereas another poet related how his grandmother used to sing and recite to him in verse, describing her natural environment in a language that was highly metaphorical. If these poets ever enjoy higher education at all, it is mainly at "peripheral" institutions, and rarely at those prestigious metropolitan universities. In other words, they are self-taught and owe more to a rich "informal" rather education than to any

formal training. What a difference from their Western colleagues! How many contemporary poets in France and Germany have obtained their doctorates and how many poets in the UK and the USA are at the same time university professors? How did it come about that Thai poets and their Western counterpart could enter into a fruitful, albeit imaginary, dialogue?

The examples from Thai and Western poetry quoted above do possess certain common characteristics that point to a deeper intellectual and spiritual foundation. Are we entitled to speak of a common humanity? But such a concept cannot satisfactorily be explained in scientific terms. I am thus compelled to look for allies in various theoretical schools and the following theoretical digressions represent an attempt to give a provisional answer.

Let us hark back to the 18th century, to the various speculations on the origin of the human language, among which the one by Johann Gottfried Herder probably suits our purpose best, as it is markedly oriented towards poetry.

Poetry is older than prose. For what is language in its beginning other than an imitation of the ringing, moving and awakening nature, a meeting point of elements of poetry? The natural language of all creatures, poeticized from mind into sound, a lexicon of the soul, a constant poetic narration, full of emotion and engagement: that is language at its origin, and is poetry different from that?<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> A German scholar, Klaus Wenk, of Hamburg University has done a great deal in the way of translating Thai poetry, both classical and contemporary, but even in Germanspeaking countries, his anthologies are rarely known. (See: *Studien zur Literatur der Thai*, Bde. 1-2-3-4, Hamburg: Das Seminar für Japanologie der Universität Hamburg, 1982-1989.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Quoted in.: Hermann Glaser et al. (Edit.): Wege der deutsheen Literatur: Ein Lesebuch, Frankfurt/M. u. Berlin: Ullstein 1989, pp. 161-162. (My Translation)

To move on from the poetic origin of the human language to a theory of the commonalities of poetry at the dawn of the new millenium might be too big a leap and certainly scholarly adventurism. Perhaps we can seek help from modern linguistics, such as Noam Chomsky's concepts of "deep structure" and "surface structure", which could throw light on our search for an answer. Moreover, we may be able to explain poetic phenomena certain "performance" which is based on a common "competence". But experts have warned that such a theory can be applicable only as a broad framework without fine technical subtleties and that a theory of the commonalties of contemporary poetry still requires further serious thinking and investigation.

If scholarly disciplines do not prove to be sufficiently helpful, can we then confide in the poets themselves? The French poet, Stéphane Mallarmé defined the mission of the poet in rather radical terms, namely, "donner un sens plus pur aux mots de la trubu", which T.S. Elliot in the footsteps of Mallarmé described as "to purify the dialect of the tribe". When we look at the concept of purification as the common goal of all poetic acts, a question arises as to whether our contemporary poets want to content themselves with just a linguistic purification or whether they wish to extend and amend Mallarmé's concept. We have seen above how Ronald Peacock characterized "regeneration" as one of the virtues of contemporary literature, and in this sense our contemporary poets have mutually responded to the challenge of the age through an implicit act of moral regeneration. Whether we are talking of the wrestling with history by Saksiri Meesomsueb, or the programmatic

demand by Christop Meckel or the internalization of an atrocious war by Denise Levertov, it is undeniable that many of our contemporary poets invariably and willingly engage themselves in a moral-philosophical debate.

If this is our conclusion, are we elevating contemporary poetry to such a dizzy height far removed from everyday life? We must find a middle position somewhere which corresponds to the real situation. Does a possibility exist in the world of today that allows us to think poetically in supranational and global terms and to express ourselves accordingly. Even some of our Thai poets who are still attached to their native soil are fully conscious that they are living in a world in which modern communications and new media cannot be ignored. (One contemporary Thai poet chooses to live at his parental home on an island in the South of Thailand but never hesitates to send his manuscripts by e-mail or telefax.) The French poet Michel Deguy openly pleads for a supranational and global communication in poetic creation.

...One should conceive of a work of art always with a vision that aims beyond those to whom it is initially addressed, surpassing the original group of reference; that is why it is preferable to aim at a "Francophonia" rather than the "French hexagon"; and even "Francophonia" is in turn to be overtaken intentionally, for example, by humanity. 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Michel Deguy: Aux heures d'affluence. Poèmes et proses, Paris: Seuil 1993, S. 32. Deguy is an excellent translator, especially

It is possible that contemporary poets unconsciously think more and more globally. From the level of direct contact with a public within the framework of the oral tradition (including its reconstructed ambience of poetry reading) to the anonymous reading public or that of the internet and the media society, there open up immense possibilities for the poets of today. Michel Deguy has not hesitated to rehabilitate the recently much-maligned word "humanity", but in a new context. The yearning for a dialogue with unknown partners is of paramount importance. This paper aims to demonstrate that a new age has dawned and that poetry possesses an immense potential to bring about a highly meaningful and valuable global dialogue.19

from German (although he maintains that his spoken German is very poor). As a translator he has tackled the works of Heidegger and Celan. The journal Po&sie which he has directed for more than 20 years publishes regularly translations of foreign poetry. 19 I would like to thank the following colleagues who indefatigably carried the research project to its fruition, namely, : Sumalee Virawongse (Thai poetry), Charturee Tingsabadh (British and Irish poetry), Nitaya Masavisut (American poetry), Achara Wanachaet (French poetry) and Sawitree Tongurai (Assistant to Project Leader and Assistant Researcher in German poetry). Last but not least, my thanks go to the Thailand Research Fund which gener-· ously supported the research project. The present paper has been freely translated by the author from the original German version: "Imaginärer Dialog. Die zeitgenössische thailändische Lyrik und ihre westlichen Gesprächspartner", in: Das Gedicht behauptet sein Recht. Festschrift für Walter Gebhard zum 65. Geburtstag. Frankfurt/ Main: Peter Lang, 2001, pp. 267-276.